

Audit & Risk Committee

Minutes of Tuesday 21 July 2020 UNCONFIRMED



INDEX

1.	Official Opening	3
2.	Attendance, Apologies and Leave of Absence Previously Approved	3
3.	Public Question Time	4
4.	Petitions/Deputations	4
5.	Confirmation of Minutes from Previous Meeting	4
6.	Announcements by the Member Presiding Without Discussion	4
7.	Matters for Which the Meeting may be Closed	4
8.	Disclosure of Interest	5
9.	Reports to Council	6
	9.1. Corporate Services Reports	6
	9.1.1. Interim Audit Findings for the year ending 30 June 2020	6
	9.1.2. Internal Audit Report July 2020	10
	9.1.3. Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996 - Outcome of Regulation 17 Review	17
	. Motions of Which Previous Notice has been Given	
11.	. Questions by Members Without Notice	22
12.	. Questions by Members of Which Due Notice has been Given	22
13.	. Urgent Business Approved by the Presiding Member or by Decision	22
14.	. Meeting Closed to the Public	22
15.	. Closure	22

1. Official Opening

The Presiding Member opened the meeting at 6:32pm and welcomed Councillors, Staff and Members of the Public Gallery. The Presiding Member also acknowledged the Traditional Owners of the land on which we meet the Whadjuk Noongar people.

2. Attendance, Apologies and Leave of Absence Previously Approved

Councillors South East Ward Janelle Sewell Geoff Stallard South West Ward Mary Cannon Brooke O'Donnell - Presiding Member North West Ward Dylan O'Connor North Ward

Cameron Blair Kathy Ritchie Margaret Thomas JP (Mayor)

Members of Staff

Chief Executive Officer Rhonda Hardy Executive Team Gary Ticehurst - Director Corporate Services Brett Jackson - Director Asset Services Peter Varelis - Director Development Services Management Team

Waruni De Silva - Acting Manager Financial Services

Administration Support

Darrell Forrest - Governance Advisor Cam Jones - IT Coordinator Donna McPherson - Executive Assistant to the CEO

External Attendees

Office of the Auditor General Patrick Arulsingham – Senior Director Suraj Karki – Assistant Director Crowe – Internal Auditors Andrew Zavitsanos – Partner Nick Goosen – Audit Manager

Members of the Public 0

Members of the Press Nil.

Apologies

Cr John Giardina Cr Lesley Boyd Cr Sue Bilich

Leave of Absence Previously Approved Cr Lisa Cooper

3. Public Question Time

A period of not less than 15 minutes is provided to allow questions from the gallery on matters relating to the functions of Council. For the purposes of Minuting, these questions and answers will be summarised.

3.1 Nil.

4. Petitions/Deputations

4.1 Nil.

5. Confirmation of Minutes from Previous Meeting

- 5.1 That the Minutes of the Audit & Risk Committee Meeting held on the 17 March 2020, as published and circulated, are confirmed as a true and accurate record of the proceedings.
 - Moved: Cr Margaret Thomas
 - Seconded: Cr Geoff Stallard
 - Vote: CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (8/0)
- 6. Announcements by the Member Presiding Without Discussion
- 6.1 Nil.

7. Matters for Which the Meeting may be Closed

7.1 Item 9.1.2 – Internal Audit Report July 2020 – CONFIDENTIAL ATTACHMENTS 1. Internal Audit Report – Review of Financial Controls, 2. Internal Audit Report – Review of CEO Credit Card, 3. Internal Audit Recommendation Tracker July 2020. <u>Reason for Confidentiality</u>: *Local Government Act 1995 (WA) Section 5.23 (2) (f) - "a matter that if disclosed, could be reasonably expected to - (i) impair the effectiveness of any lawful method or procedure for preventing, detecting, investigating or dealing with any contravention or possible contravention of the law; (ii) endanger the security of the local government's property; or (iii) prejudice the maintenance or enforcement of a lawful measure for protecting public safety"* 7.2 Item 9.1.3 – Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996 – Outcome of Regulation 17 Review - CONFIDENTIAL ATTACHMENTS 1. Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996 – Regulation 17 Review. <u>Reason for</u> <u>Confidentiality</u>: Local Government Act 1995 (WA) Section 5.23 (2) (f) - "a matter that if disclosed, could be reasonably expected to - (i) impair the effectiveness of any lawful method or procedure for preventing, detecting, investigating or dealing with any contravention or possible contravention of the law; (ii) endanger the security of the local government's property; or (iii) prejudice the maintenance or enforcement of a lawful measure for protecting public safety"

8. Disclosure of Interest

8.1. Disclosure of Financial and Proximity Interests

- a. Members must disclose the nature of their interest in matter to be discussed at the meeting. (Section 5.56 of the *Local Government Act 1995*.)
- b. Employees must disclose the nature of their interest in reports or advice when giving the report or advice to the meeting. (Section 5.70 of the *Local Government Act 1995*.)
- 8.1.1 Nil.

8.2. Disclosure of Interest Affecting Impartiality

- a. Members and staff must disclose their interest in matters to be discussed at the meeting in respect of which the member or employee had given or will give advice.
- 8.2.1 Nil.

9. Reports to Council

9.1. Corporate Services Reports

9.1.1. Interim Audit Findings for the year ending 30 June 2020

Mr Patrick Arulsingham – Senior Director the Office of the Auditor General provided Council with a summary of the findings of the Audit.

Council sought clarification on some matters of the Audit and this was provided.

Declaration of financial / conflict of interests to be recorded prior to dealing with each item.

Previous Items Directorate Business Unit File Reference	Nil. Corporate Services Financial Services
Applicant Owner	N/A N/A
Attachments	 Planning Summary City of Kalamunda 2020 [9.1.1.1 - 14 pages]

2. City of Kalamunda - Interim Audit Findings for the year ending 30 June 2020 [**9.1.1.2** - 4 pages]

TYPE OF REPORT

Advocacy	When Council is advocating on behalf of the community to another level of government/body/agency
Executive	When Council is undertaking its substantive role of direction setting and oversight (eg accepting tenders, adopting plans and budgets
Information	For Council to note
Legislative	Includes adopting Local Laws, Town Planning Schemes and Policies. When Council determines a matter that directly impacts a person's rights and interests where the principles of natural justice apply. Examples include town planning applications, building licences, other permits or licences issued under other Legislation or matters that could be subject to appeal to the State Administrative Tribunal

STRATEGIC PLANNING ALIGNMENT

Kalamunda Advancing Strategic Community Plan to 2027

Priority 4: Kalamunda Leads

Objective 4.1 - To provide leadership through transparent governance. *Strategy 4.1.1* - Provide good governance.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1. The purpose of this report is to provide Council with the findings of the Interim Audit by the Auditor (Attachment 2).
- 2. The Interim Audit for the financial year ending 30 June 2020 was undertaken by the Office of the Auditor General, in accordance with the audit planning document (Attachment 1).
- 3. It is recommended that Council accepts the 2019/2020 Interim Audit Report. (Attachment 2).

BACKGROUND

- On 28 October 2017, the Local Government Amendment (Auditing) Act 2017 was proclaimed, giving the Auditor General the mandate to audit Western Australia's 139 local governments and 9 regional councils.
- 5. The Act allowed the Auditor General to conduct performance audits of local government entities from 28 October 2017. From the 2018/2019 financial year, the City's audit was performed by the Office of the Auditor General (OAG).

DETAILS AND ANALYSIS

- 6. The OAG prepared an audit plan (Attachment 1) for their approach to the audit of the annual financial report for the year ending 30 June 2020, and in summary included the following:
 - a) Introduction
 - b) Audit Approach
 - c) Significant Risks and Other Audit Issues
 - d) Audit Emphasis and Significant Account Balances
 - e) Internal Audit
 - f) Management Representation Letter
 - g) Related Entities
 - h) Reporting Protocols
 - i) Proposed Audit Schedule

- j) Specific Audit Requirements
- k) Audit Team
- l) Other Audit Activities
- m) Audit fees
- 7. In May 2020, City staff met with relevant officers from the OAG, to discuss the audit plan. The interim audit field work was carried out from 18 May 2020 to 29 May 2020, with Attachment 2 being the outcome of the interim audit.
- The OAG identified three findings as part of the interim audit with two rated as moderate risk and one as minor, as detailed in Attachment 2. The City will aim to implement all recommendations from the OAG by the end of November 2020.
- The final component of the fieldwork for the 2019/2020 financial year's audit of the annual financial report will be conducted during October 2020, with the final results brought to an Audit and Risk Committee Meeting once available.

APPLICABLE LAW

- 10. Sections 6.4, 7.9, 7.12A of the Local Government Act 1995 and Local Government Amendment (Auditing) Act 2017.
- 11. Regulation 51 of the Local Government (Financial Management) Regulations 1996.

APPLICABLE POLICY

12. There are no policy implications.

STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT

13. The Administration worked closely with the Auditors.

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

14. The Budget includes provision for the cost of having the accounts and the Annual Financial Report audited by an externally appointed registered auditor.

SUSTAINABILITY

Social Implications

15. Nil.

Economic Implications

16. Nil.

Environmental Implications

17. Nil.

RISK MANAGEMENT

18.

Risk: Issues identified in the interim audit report are not rectified.ConsequenceLikelihoodRatingSignificantUnlikelyMediumAction/StrategyMediumMediumEmploy qualified suitably skilled staff.Maintain controls and compliance with policy.Ensure an effective internal audit program.Management oversight.Management oversight.Management oversight.

CONCLUSION

19. The interim audit field work was carried out in accordance with the audit plan prepared by OAG during May 2020.

Three items were identified during audit field work none of which have a significant rating. The City will rectify all issues immediately.

Voting Requirements: Absolute Majority COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION TO COUNCIL

That Council ACCEPTS the findings of the Interim Audit undertaken in May 2020 for the financial year ending 30 June 2020 (Attachment 2).

Moved: Cr Margaret Thomas

Seconded: Cr Cameron Blair

Vote: CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (8/0)

9.1.2. Internal Audit Report July 2020

Declaration of financial / conflict of interests to be recorded prior to dealing with each item.

Andrew Zavitsanos – Partner – Crowe provided Council with a summary of the findings of the Internal Audit as presented.

Council sought clarification on some findings and recommendations of the Internal Audit and this was provided.

Previous Items Directorate Business Unit File Reference Applicant Owner	Corporate Services Corporate Services
Attachments	1. Internal Audit - Mid year Report [9.1.2.1 - 9 pages]
Confidential Attachments	 General Financial Controls Audit Report CEO Credit Card review Internal Audit Recommendation Tracker Reason for Confidentiality: Local Government Act 1995 (WA) Section 5.23 (2) (f) - "a matter that if disclosed, could be reasonably expected to - (i) impair the effectiveness of any lawful method or procedure for preventing, detecting, investigating or dealing with any contravention or possible contravention of the law; (ii) endanger the security of the
	local government's property; or (iii) prejudice the maintenance or enforcement of a lawful measure for protecting public safety".

TYPE OF REPORT

Advocacy	When Council is advocating on behalf of the community to another level of government/body/agency
Executive	When Council is undertaking its substantive role of direction setting and oversight (eg accepting tenders, adopting plans and budgets
Information	For Council to note
Legislative	Includes adopting Local Laws, Town Planning Schemes and Policies. When Council determines a matter that directly impacts a person's rights and interests where the principles of natural justice apply. Examples include town planning applications, building licences, other permits or licences

issued under other Legislation or matters that could be subject to appeal to the State Administrative Tribunal

STRATEGIC PLANNING ALIGNMENT

Kalamunda Advancing Strategic Community Plan to 2027

Priority 4: Kalamunda Leads

Objective 4.1 - To provide leadership through transparent governance. *Strategy 4.1.1* - Provide good governance.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1. The purpose of this report is to provide Council with:
 - a) Details of Internal Audit Reviews conducted during the past quarter
 - b) Details of the Internal Audit Recommendation Tracker
 - c) An Amended three-year Strategic Internal Audit Plan
- 2. The Internal Audit was completed in accordance with the provisions of the *Local Government Act 1995,* associated regulations, *Australian Accounting Standards.* The Internal Audit has identified a number of improvement opportunities which the City of Kalamunda (the City) is committed to implementing.
- 3. It is recommended that Council:
 - a) RECEIVE The details of Internal Audit Reviews conducted during the last quarter.
 - b) RECEIVE the details of the Internal Audit Recommendation Tracker.
 - c) AMEND the three-year Strategic Internal Audit Plan.

BACKGROUND

4. The Internal Audit program is delivered in line with the City's three-year Strategic Internal Audit Plan (the Plan) which contains a mix of compliance, financial, and performance / operational audits.

Since the commencement of this plan 25 engagements from the internal audit plan were completed through the City's appointed internal auditor Crowe Pty Ltd (formerly Crowe Howarth) Other work undertaken by Crowe Pty Ltd ('Crowe') included:

- a) the setting of the strategic internal audit plan;
- b) attendance and presentation of internal audit reports to the Audit & Risk Committee; and
- c) client liaison and engagement.

5. Internal Audit is a core element of the City's risk management and governance framework. The relationship between Internal Audit and the City can be summarised using the "Three Lines of Defence model illustrated below



Broadly, Internal Audit reviews are focused on:

- a) <u>Compliance Audits</u>: Focused primarily on the entity's (or their suppliers') compliance with legislation, regulations, directions, policies, plans, and procedures.
- b) <u>Financial Audits</u>: Focused primarily on practices and activities relating to the accounting and reporting of financial transactions including budget commitments, approvals, and the receipt and disbursement of funds, as well as the reliability and integrity of financial information and the safeguarding of the assets.
- c) <u>Performance (Operational) Audits</u>: Focused primarily on an audit of all or a part of an entity's activities to assess the economy, efficiency and effectiveness and focuses on:
 - i. the adequacy of an internal control structure or specific internal controls to ensure due regard for economy and effectiveness;
 - ii. the extent to which resources have been managed economically and efficiently; and
 - iii. the extent to which activities have been effective in achieving organisational objectives.
- 7. As part of the budget deliberations for budget 2020/2021, the parameters were set to reduce discretional expenditure to enable the City to support our community through the COVID-19 pandemic. Internal Audit funding was impacted and the three-year Strategic Internal Audit Plan is to be amended accordingly. As and when the City is in full recovery mode, additional expenditure may be allocated to reinstate parts of the Plan as appropriate.

The Mid-Year Review (attachment 4) details the audits undertaken during the 2020 calandar year to date. Additionally, details the amendment to the Three-year Strategice Internal Audit Plan.

6.

The following internal audit is to continue for the 2020/2021 financial year:

- a) General Financial Controls 120 hours
- b) Occupational Health and Safety Part 2 60 hours
- c) Health Business Unit Review 60 hours
- d) 10 hours allocated for the attendance to the Audit and Risk Committee Meetings

DETAILS AND ANALYSIS

- 8. The Internal Audit Reviews undertaken during the past quarter have been focused on:
 - a) General Financial Controls
 - b) CEO Credit Card Review
- 9. The completed Internal Audit Review during the past quarter did not identify any material control deficiencies.

10. General Financial Controls

In line with the City's Internal Audit Program, Crowe undertook an internal audit of the financial controls in accordance with Section 5 (2) (c) of the *Local Government (Financial Management) Regulations 1996* (**Regulations**).

The objective of the internal audit was to assess the appropriateness and effectiveness of the financial management systems and procedures in place at the City.

The scope of the internal audit included the following areas:

- a) Petty Cash;
- b) Receipts and Receivables (front counter);
- c) Receipting Administration (libraries, recreation centres, health, and community care);
- d) Fringe Benefits Tax (desktop review);
- e) GST/BAS (desktop review);
- f) Bonds (desktop review);
- g) Annual Budget and Budget Review;
- h) Financial Reporting;
- i) Journals;
- j) Registers;
- k) Delegations; and
- I) Insurance.
- 11. The results of the General Financial Controls Audit are detailed in Confidential Attachment 1.

12. CEO Credit Card Review

The objective of the internal audit was to examine a random sample of 20 credit card transactions for the period 1 March 2019 to 29 February 2020 and determine if the transactions complied with the City's corporate credit card policy as well as the appropriateness of the acquittal process.

- 13. The results of the General Financial Controls Audit & CEO Credit Card review are detailed in Confidential Attachment 2.
- 14. The City monitors the status of audit recommendations arising from each Internal Audit Review (Confidential Attachment 3). Recommendations are monitored to ensure that they are managed and implemented in a timely fashion. The majority of recommendations are either complete or in progress.

APPLICABLE LAW

15. Local Government Act 1995 Local Government (Financial Management) Regulations 1996 Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996

APPLICABLE POLICY

16. Nil.

STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT

17. Internal Audit findings were discussed with relevant business unit managers and have been reviewed by the City's Executive Management Team.

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

18. The cost of the Internal Audit program is provisioned within the City's annual budget. Further, monitoring and review of internal controls within the Internal Audit program will reduce the risk and likely exposure of potential loss to the City.

SUSTAINABILITY

Social Implications

19. Nil.

Economic Implications

20. Nil.

Environmental Implications

21. Nil.

22.

RISK MANAGEMENT

Risk: Internal Audit fails to identify material non-compliance or control deficiencies.

Consequence	Likelihood	Rating
Moderate	Unlikely	Low
Action/Strategy		
Internal Audit Plan developed and reviewed annually.		
Internal Audit working papers reviewed by External Auditors.		
Key controls are evalu	lated for the identified proc	cesses.

23. Risk: Audit recommendations are not implemented in a timely fashion.

 Consequence
 Likelihood
 Rating

 Moderate
 Unlikely
 Low

 Action/Strategy
 Internal Audit Plan developed and reviewed annually.

Monitoring and review of the implementation of audit recommendations.

CONCLUSION

24. The City monitors the status of Internal Audit recommendations arising from each Internal Audit Review (Confidential Attachment 3). Recommendations are monitored and the majority of recommendations are either complete or in progress.

Voting Requirements: Simple Majority

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION TO COUNCIL

That Council:

- 1. RECEIVE the details of the Internal Audit Review conducted during the past quarter.
- 2. NOTE the status of the Internal Audit Tracker.
- 3. AMEND the three year Strategic Internal Audit Plan.

Moved: Cr Dylan O'Connor

Seconded: Cr Janelle Sewell

Vote: CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (8/0)

Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996 - Outcome of 9.1.3. **Regulation 17 Review**

Declaration of financial / conflict of interests to be recorded prior to dealing with each item.

	Previous Items Director Busines File Refe Applicar Owner	ate s Unit erence	Corporate Services Financial Services N/A N/A
	Attachm	nents	Nil
	Confide Attachm		 Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996 – Regulation 17 Review.
ТҮРЕ	OF REPORT		Reason for Confidentiality: Local Government Act 1995 (WA) Section 5.23 (2) (f) - "a matter that if disclosed, could be reasonably expected to - (i) impair the effectiveness of any lawful method or procedure for preventing, detecting, investigating or dealing with any contravention or possible contravention of the law; (ii) endanger the security of the local government's property; or (iii) prejudice the maintenance or enforcement of a lawful measure for protecting public safety"
	Advocacy		n Council is advocating on behalf of the community to her level of government/body/agency
	Executive	setti	n Council is undertaking its substantive role of direction ng and oversight (eg accepting tenders, adopting plans budgets
	Information	For (Council to note
	Legislative	Polic impa natu appl issue	ides adopting Local Laws, Town Planning Schemes and ties. When Council determines a matter that directly acts a person's rights and interests where the principles of ral justice apply. Examples include town planning ications, building licences, other permits or licences ed under other Legislation or matters that could be ect to appeal to the State Administrative Tribunal

STRATEGIC PLANNING ALIGNMENT

Kalamunda Advancing Strategic Community Plan to 2027

Priority 4: Kalamunda Leads Objective 4.1 - To provide leadership through transparent governance. *Strategy 4.1.1* - Provide good governance.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1. The purpose of this report is to provide Council with the findings and recommendations arising out of the review undertaken pursuant to Regulation 17 of *the Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996* (Regulations).
- 2. The Regulations require the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to review the appropriateness and effectiveness of the local government's systems and procedures in relation to risk management, internal control, and legislative compliance.
- 3. It is recommended that Council receive the findings of Regulation 17 Review.

BACKGROUND

- 4. The r 16 of the Regulations requires the Audit and Risk Committee to review a report given by the CEO with regards to r 17.
- 5. Regulation 17 of the *Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996* states the following:

1) The CEO is to review the appropriateness and effectiveness of a local government's systems and procedures in relation to –

- (a) risk management; and
- (b) internal control; and
- (c) legislative compliance.

2) The review may relate to any or all of the matters referred to in subregulation (1)(a), (b) and (c), but each of those matters is to be the subject of a review not less than once in every 3 financial years.

3) The CEO is to report to the audit committee the results of that review

 This review adds to and compliments the Internal Audit program which also conducts regular reviews of the appropriateness and effectiveness of systems and procedures.

- 7. The details of the reviews are reported to the Council through the Audit and Risk Committee recommendations.
- 8. The pervious Regulation 17 review was undertaken in 2016/17.

DETAILS AND ANALYSIS

- 9. A review pursuant to r 17 is required every 3 financial years and is due as part of the 2019/2020 financial year.
- 10. To facilitate the overall review, the City of Kalamunda (City) has an extensive three-year Strategic Internal Audit Plan (SIAP), as approved by Council, to schedule ongoing assessments of risk management, internal controls, and legislative compliance to meet the requirements by Regulation 17.
 As part of the SIAP, 24 internal audits have been completed in the last three financial years. Upon completion, internal audit reports are presented to the Audit and Risk Committee. Additionally, recommendations from Crowe (Internal Auditor) and relevant management comments are contained in a tracker document and presented to the Audit and Risk Committee a regular basis. This provides the Council with surety that all recommendations are followed up and actioned appropriately
- 11. The risk management, internal control, and legislative compliance systems of the City were reviewed, tested and a report of the findings and recommendations has been prepared for the Audit and Risk Committee on the appropriateness and effectiveness of the internal control environment (Attachment 1).

APPLICABLE LAW

12. Local Government Act 1995 Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996

APPLICABLE POLICY

13. Nil.

STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT

- 14. The review were discussed with relevant business unit managers and have been reviewed by the City's Executive Management Team.
- 15. No community consultation is required for this review.

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

16. The cost of this review and the Internal Audit program is provisioned within the City's annual budget.

SUSTAINABILITY

Social Implications

17. Nil.

Economic Implications

18. Nil.

Environmental Implications

19. Nil.

RISK MANAGEMENT

20.

Consequence	Likelihood	Rating
Unlikely	Moderate	Low
Action/Strategy		
(a) risk ma (b) interna	ternal Audit Plan prov nagement; and l control; and ve compliance,	ides for ongoing assessments

CONCLUSION

21. The *Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996* regulation 17 review was completed in accordance with the provisions of the *Local Government Act 1995*, associated regulations, and the applicable policies and procedures.

Recommendations from the review are currently being implanted.

Voting Requirements: Simple Majority

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION TO COUNCIL

That Council RECEIVE the outcomes of the *Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996* Regulation 17 Review (Attachment 1)

- Moved: Cr Dylan O'Connor
- Seconded: Cr Margaret Thomas

Vote: CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (8/0)

10. Motions of Which Previous Notice has been Given

- 10.0 Nil.
- **11.** Questions by Members Without Notice
- 11.0 Nil.
- 12. Questions by Members of Which Due Notice has been Given
- 12.0 Nil.
- **13.** Urgent Business Approved by the Presiding Member or by Decision
- 13.0 Nil.

14. Meeting Closed to the Public

14.0 Nil.

15. Closure

There being no further business, the Presiding Member declared the Meeting closed at 7:06pm.

I confirm these Minutes to be a true and accurate record of the proceedings of this Council.

Signed: _____

Presiding Member

Dated this _____ day of _____ 2020.